Beyond Communication and Social Interaction: A Review on Designing for People with Dementia

Jiamin Dai

jiamin.dai@mail.mcgill.ca

Karyn Moffatt

karyn.moffatt@mcgill.ca

School of Information Studies, McGill University 3661 rue Peel, Montréal, Québec H3A 1X1 Canada

Abstract

We reviewed 26 full papers on designing for people with dementia (PwD) in recent ACM SIGACCESS and SIGCHI proceedings. Through the lens of a conceptual framework for dementia care, we mapped the qualityof-life aspects addressed by and missing in the papers. Our findings show current HCI research focuses on

Paste the appropriate copyright/license statement here. ACM now supports three different publication options:

- ACM copyright: ACM holds the copyright on the work. This is the historical approach.
- License: The author(s) retain copyright, but ACM receives an exclusive publication license.
- Open Access: The author(s) wish to pay for the work to be open access. The additional fee must be paid to ACM.

This text field is large enough to hold the appropriate release statement assuming it is single-spaced in Verdana 7 point font. Please do not change the size of this text box.

Each submission will be assigned a unique DOI string to be included here.

communication and social interaction for PwD, and we discuss the gaps in the literature for future work.

Author Keywords

Dementia; design; review.

ACM Classification Keywords

H5.m. Information interfaces and presentation (e.g., HCI): Miscellaneous.

Introduction

The HCI literature on designing for PwD is growing. A wide range of research projects have touched on various aspects of quality of life from dealing with wandering and wayfinding to supporting creating and sharing (e.g., [10, 12, 20, 23]). However, there is a lack of mapping between the HCI research conducted and the needs of dementia care. To this end, we adopted a conceptual framework for dementia care to examine the relevant ACM SIGACCESS and SIGCHI sponsored conference proceedings in recent years. We aim to map the existing literature and provide an overview of the research contributions and gaps regarding designing for PwD and their family and caregivers.

| | No. of Papers |
|-------|---------------|
| 2010 | 3 |
| 2012 | 4 |
| 2013 | 3 |
| 2014 | 3 |
| 2016 | 5 |
| 2017 | 8 |
| Total | 26 |

Table 1: Number of papers in review by year of publication.

| | No. of Papers |
|----------|---------------|
| CHI | 11 |
| ASSETS | 3 |
| DIS | 3 |
| NordiCHI | 2 |
| APCHI | 1 |
| CSCW | 1 |
| C&C | 1 |
| ECCE | 1 |
| GROUP | 1 |
| HRI | 1 |
| TEI | 1 |
| Total | 26 |

Table 2: Number of papers in review by venue of publication.

The Conceptual Framework

The adopted conceptual framework for PwD and their caregivers highlights health-related quality of life elements specific to dementia across five conceptual domains:

- Daily activities and looking after yourself: getting around, keeping yourself clean, getting dressed, going to the toilet, using a knife and fork, etc.
- Health and well-being: global health, happiness/depression, contentment/frustration, enjoying life/enjoying nothing, confidence, etc.
- Cognitive functioning: memory for recent/distant events, concentration, communication, etc.
- Social relationships: treatment by others, social interaction, reciprocity, social integration, etc.
- *Self-concept*: self-esteem, presentation of self, sense of independence, feeling useful, etc. [26].

Incorporating the views of both PwD and their family caregivers, this framework presents a detailed picture of living with dementia and provides a holistic map for analyzing the interaction design contributions and gaps in the context of dementia care.

Methods

We searched the ACM Digital Library's full-text collection with the keywords "design AND dementia" OR "design AND Alzheimer" in all fields, and we refined with SIGACCESS and SIGCHI sponsored conferences. This initial search returned 80 results (as of January 2, 2018), and we selected the full papers among them. As a result, this review examined 26 papers (i.e., [1-5, 7-8, 10-21, 23-25, 27-30]) published during 2010 and 2017 (see Table 1) in 11 venues (see Table 2). For each paper, we summarized the design outcomes, research methods, and participants involved. The design outcomes included tablet and mobile applications, smart homes, props, robots, virtual world prototypes, and tracking systems. Qualitative methods were most frequently used and typically involved a thematic analysis of interview, focus group, or design workshop transcripts and field observation notes. A variety of participants were involved in different research stages, including PwD, family and professional caregivers, art therapists, occupational therapists, and staff and volunteers of care facilities.

Then, we took a top-down approach and coded the descriptive components of the above framework based on the issues addressed by each paper. For example, a case study of a GPS tracking system used in dementia care [2] was coded for daily activity of "getting around". It also discussed using technologies in professional dementia care and the self-esteem issue in value-sensitive design, so "social support" and "self-esteem" were also coded.

Findings and Discussions

The components frequently addressed Overall, all five domains are addressed. The most frequently appeared components are "communication" and "social interaction", followed by "getting around" and "sense of independence". Other recurring components include "reciprocity", "self-esteem", "feeling safe", etc. (see Table 3). It indicates that the HCI community has primarily focused on facilitating communication and social interaction for PwD, usually addressing them together. In addition, many projects share a common devotion to assisting PwD in getting around and maintaining their sense of independence. Social relationships: "social interaction" (19), "reciprocity" (7), "social integration" (5), "intimacy and physical affection" (5), "treatment by others" (4). Cognitive functioning:

"communication" (19), "place and person" (5), "memory for distant events" (4).

Daily activities and looking after yourself:

"getting around" (10),

"getting where you need to go" (5),

"being able to enjoy what you want to" (4).

Self-concept:

"sense of independence" (9), "self-esteem" (7).

Health and well-being:

"feeling safe" (7),

"enjoying life" (5).

Table 3: The descriptive components addressed by more than 3 papers (number of papers in the brackets). When helping PwD enjoy life and connect with people, researchers emphasize PwD's safety and self-esteem.

The components less addressed and unaddressed The following components are addressed by no more than 3 papers: "getting in touch with people when you need to", "taking care of finances", "choice about how you spend your time", "global health", "happiness/ depression", "confidence", "anxiety", "feeling lively, cheerful, relaxed", "memory for recent events", "concentration", "orientation in time", "making your mind up", "companionship", "social support", "other emotional relationships", "presentation of self", "satisfaction with past/present life", "hopes and aspirations for the future", and "feeling useful". Most components about daily activities are notably missing, i.e., "keeping yourself clean", "getting dressed", "keeping yourself looking nice", "going to the toilet", "using a knife and fork", "getting the things you need from the shops", "getting meals", "taking care of the house", "using money to buy everyday things", and "things that you want to do but can't". Other missing components are "contentment/frustration", "embarrassment", "loneliness", "somatic complaints", "feeling irritable, angry, resentful, sad, distressed", "memory for names", and "clarity of thought".

The above components reveal the possible gaps in the existing HCI literature. Except for getting around, the majority of daily activities are less supported. Outside the review scope, assistive technologies have been developed for daily routines, e.g., automatic task assistance in brushing teeth and washing hands for people with cognitive impairments [6, 22]. These projects have focused on AI challenges such as sensors and decision processes, instead of interface issues. As it

has a positive impact on PwD to maintain a sense of normality and keep up appearances [26], these everyday routines are worth investigating further. By facilitating such daily tasks as eating, shopping, housekeeping, and keeping personal hygiene, the design outcomes could help to improve PwD's autonomy and sense of independence, in turn reducing the caregiver burden.

Researchers could also pay attention to all kinds of emotions and the mental status of PwD, increasing those positive feelings while reducing the negative ones. PwD value emotions as part of their well-being, but they might have to express their feelings in a concrete way of describing activities they enjoyed [26]. Therefore, it requires creative thinking and a keen eye to capture these subtle feelings in future study design, field observation, and data analysis. For example, a preliminary study on developing a smartwatch prototype for evaluating the emotional responses of PwD is a good start in this direction [9].

Outside the framework

During the coding process, we found some themes outside the framework appearing in several papers. In line with reducing reliance upon caregivers, personhood and autonomy rise from the discussions together with safety and independence, while technology could step in to balance the conflicts between those components [13-14]. The privacy and ethical issues of involving this vulnerable user group are noticed and respected. Furthermore, the case studies situated in the context of art therapy have expanded the horizons of designing for dementia by promoting entertaining, creative, and aesthetically-pleasing activities. These papers contribute to understanding the complex nature of sharing for PwD, designing novel and customizable tools for art therapy sessions, exploring a model of empathy and empowerment, and reflecting on epistemological perspectives for dementia and design [1, 7, 10-12]. Creativity is approached differently by a project exploring how to support creative thinking and problem solving by caregivers through a mobile application [30]. In a similar vein of person-centered care as art therapy, this app works from the angle of providing novel care in residential homes.

Limitations

This review is limited to a small scale at this stage; in future work, we plan to expand to more ACM journals and conferences, as well as to other databases. The adopted framework could not cover every aspect of dementia care, and the coding relied on our interpretation which might be open for discussion. The research projects in review were conducted in different economic, social, and cultural contexts, so fitting them into one framework might overlook this diversity.

Conclusions

In mapping the research contributions and gaps in this review, we find the current HCI research tries to help PwD with cognitive functioning and social relationships, as well as addressing some aspects of daily activities, self-concept, and well-being. With an aging population and an increasing number of families affected by dementia, the HCI community faces growing demands and responsibilities for designing for dementia care. Continuing to facilitate communication and social interaction and explore person-centered care, future research could seek inspiration and collaboration in related fields and expand to supporting more daily routines and attending to the rich emotions of PwD.

References

- Raymundo Cornejo, Robin Brewer, Caroline Edasis, Anne Marie Piper. 2016. Vulnerability, sharing, and privacy: Analyzing art therapy for older adults with dementia. In Proceedings of the 19th ACM Conference on Computer-Supported Cooperative Work & Social Computing (CSCW '16). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2818048.2819960
- Yngve Dahl, Kristine Holbø. 2012. Value biases of sensor-based assistive technology: Case study of a GPS tracking system used in dementia care. In *Proceedings of the Designing Interactive Systems Conference* (DIS '12). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2317956.2318043
- Jelle van Dijk, Caroline Hummels. 2017. Designing for embodied being-in-the-world: Two cases, seven principles and one framework. In *Proceedings of the 11th International Conference on Tangible, Embedded, and Embodied Interaction* (TEI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3024969.3025007
- Pin Sym Foong, Shengdong Zhao, Kelsey Carlson, Zhe Liu. 2017. Vita: Towards supporting volunteer interactions with long-term care residents with dementia. In Proc of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025776
- 5. Denise Hebesberger, Christian Dondrup, Tobias Koertner, Christoph Gisinger, Juergen Pripfl. 2016. Lessons learned from the deployment of a longterm autonomous robot as companion in physical therapy for older adults with dementia: A mixed methods study. In *Proc of the 11th ACM/IEEE Int Conference on Human Robot Interaction* (HRI '16).
- Jesse Hoey, Pascal Poupart, Axel von Bertoldi, Tammy Craig, Craig Boutilier, Alex Mihailidis. 2010. Automated handwashing assistance for persons with dementia using video and a partially observable Markov decision process. *Computer Vision and Image Understanding*, 114, 5: 503-519. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cviu.2009.06.008

- Jesse Hoey, Krists Zutis, Valerie Leuty, Alex Mihailidis. 2010. A tool to promote prolonged engagement in art therapy: Design and development from arts therapist requirements. In Proceedings of the 12th International ACM SIGACCESS Conference on Computers and Accessibility (ASSETS '10). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/1878803.1878841
- Kristine Holbø, Silje Bøthun, Yngve Dahl. 2013. Safe walking technology for people with dementia: What do they want? In Proceedings of the 15th International ACM SIGACCESS Conference on Computers and Accessibility (ASSETS '13). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2513383.2513434
- Stephan Huber, Jan Pressler, Nam Ly Tung, Jorn Hurtienne. 2017. Evaluating interaction-triggered emotions in people with dementia. In *Proceedings* of the SIGCHI Conference Extended Abstracts on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3027063.3053251
- Amanda Lazar, Raymundo Cornejo, Caroline Edasis, Anne Marie Piper. 2016. Designing for the third hand: Empowering older adults with cognitive impairment through creating and sharing. In *Proceedings of the 2016 ACM Conference on Designing Interactive Systems* (DIS '16). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2901790.2901854
- 11. Amanda Lazar, Caroline Edasis, Anne Marie Piper. 2017. A critical lens on dementia and design in HCI. In *Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025522
- Amanda Lazar, Caroline Edasis, Anne Marie Piper. 2017. Supporting people with dementia in digital social sharing. In *Proc of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025586
- 13. Stephen Lindsay, Katie Brittain, Daniel Jackson, Cassim Ladha, Karim Ladha, Patrick Olivier. 2012.

Empathy, participatory design and people with dementia. In *Proc of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (CHI '12). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2207676.2207749

- 14. Galina Madjaroff, Helena Mentis. 2017. Narratives of older adults with mild cognitive impairment and their caregivers. In *Proceedings of the 19th International ACM SIGACCESS Conference on Computers and Accessibility* (ASSETS '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3132525.3132554
- Roisin McNaney, John Vines, Jamie Mercer, Leon Mexter, Daniel Welsh, Tony Young. 2017. Demyouth: Co-designing and enacting tools to support young people's engagement with people with dementia. In Proc of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025558
- Mohsin Ali Memon, Jiro Tanaka, Tomonari Kamba. 2012. Restrain from pervasive logging employing geo-temporal policies. In *Proceedings of the 10th Asia Pacific Conference on Computer Human Interaction* (APCHI '12). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2350046.2350087
- 17. Kellie Morrissey, Andrew Garbett, Peter Wright, Patrick Olivier, Edward Ian Jenkins, Katie Brittain. 2017. Care and connect: Exploring dementiafriendliness through an online community commissioning platform. In *Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025732
- Kellie Morrissey, John McCarthy, Nadia Pantidi. 2017. The value of experience-centred design approaches in dementia research contexts. In Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '17). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/3025453.3025527
- 19. Kellie Morrissey, Gavin Wood, David Green, Nadia Pantidi, John McCarthy. 2016. 'I'm a rambler, I'm a

gambler, I'm a long way from home': The place of props, music, and design in dementia care. In *Proceedings of the 2016 ACM Conference on Designing Interactive Systems* (DIS '16). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2901790.2901798

- 20. Claudia Müller, Lin Wan, Dalibor Hrg. 2010. Dealing with wandering: A case study on caregivers' attitudes towards privacy and autonomy when reflecting the use of LBS. In *Proc of the 16th ACM Int Conference on Supporting Group Work* (GROUP '10). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/1880071.1880082
- Maurice Mulvenna, Suzanne Martin, Stefan Sävenstedt, Johan Bengtsson, Franka Meiland, Rose Marie Dröes, Marike Hettinga, Ferial Moelaert, David Craig. 2010. Designing & evaluating a cognitive prosthetic for people with mild dementia. In Proceedings of the 28th Annual European Conference on Cognitive Ergonomics (ECCE '10). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/1962300.1962306
- Christian Peters, Thomas Hermann, Sven Wachsmuth, Jesse Hoey. 2014. Automatic task assistance for people with cognitive disabilities in brushing teeth – A user study with the TEBRA system. ACM Trans. Access. Comput., 5, 4: 1-34. http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2579700
- Kirsten Rassmus-Gröhn, Charlotte Magnusson. 2014. Finding the way home: Supporting wayfinding for older users with memory problems. In Proceedings of the 8th Nordic Conference on Human-Computer Interaction (NordiCHI '14). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2639189.2639233
- Britta F. Schulte, Paul Marshall, Anna L. Cox. 2016. Homes for life: A design fiction probe. In Proceedings of the 9th Nordic Conference on Human-Computer Interaction (NordiCHI '16). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2971485.2993925
- 25. Panote Siriaraya, Chee Siang Ang. 2014. Recreating living experiences from past memories through virtual worlds for people with dementia. In

Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '14). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2556288.2557035

- 26. Sarah C. Smith, Joanna Murray, Sube Banerjee, Beth Foley, Joanna C. Cook, Donna L. Lamping, Martin Prince, Rowan H. Harwood, Enid Levin, Anthony Mann. 2005. What constitutes healthrelated quality of life in dementia? Development of a conceptual framework for people with dementia and their carers. *International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry*, 20, 9: 889-895. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/qps.1374
- 27. Jayne Wallace, Anja Thieme, Gavin Wood, Guy Schofield, Patrick Olivier. 2012. Enabling self, intimacy and a sense of home in dementia: An enquiry into design in a hospital setting. In Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '12). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2207676.2208654
- Jayne Wallace, Peter C. Wright, John McCarthy, David Philip Green, James Thomas, Patrick Olivier. 2013. A design-led inquiry into personhood in dementia. In Proc of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems (CHI '13). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2470654.2481363
- 29. Lin Wan, Claudia Müller, Volker Wulf, David William Randall. 2014. Addressing the subtleties in dementia care: Pre-study & evaluation of a GPS monitoring system. In *Proceedings of the SIGCHI Conference on Human Factors in Computing Systems* (CHI '14). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2556288.2557307
- Kos Zachos, Neil Maiden, Kristine Pitts, Sara Jones, Ian Turner, Malcolm Rose, Kevin Pudney, Julie MacManus. 2013. A software app to support creativity in dementia care. In *Proceedings of the* 9th ACM Conference on Creativity & Cognition (C&C '13). http://dx.doi.org/10.1145/2466627.2466637